

**SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT
1250 SAN CARLOS AVENUE, SAN CARLOS, CALIFORNIA**

**MINUTES OF BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
OCTOBER 10, 2012**

Board Members Present: J. Deal (Chair), C. Groom, R. Guilbault, S. Harris, Z. Kersteen-Tucker, A. Lloyd, K. Matsumoto, A. Tissier

Board Members Absent: J. Gee

Staff Present: J. Averill, J. Cassman, A. Chan, G. Harrington, C. Harvey, R. Haskin, M. Martinez, N. McKenna, D. Miller, M. Simon

Chair Jerry Deal called the meeting to order at 3:09 p.m.

PUBLIC HEARING

District Secretary Martha Martinez said the public hearing for discontinuing participation in the BART Plus Ticket Program effective January 1, 2013 and the elimination of select unproductive fixed-route trips effective January 13, 2013 was announced at the August 8 meeting.

Advertisements appeared in the *San Mateo Daily Journal* on September 11 and 25, *Pacifica Tribune* on September 12 and October 3 and *El Observador* on September 14 and October 5. The public hearing notice announced the date, time and subject of the hearing. The public hearing was publicized through the San Mateo County Transit District's (District) printed agendas, *Notice to Patrons* placed on buses, information on the SamTrans and 511.org websites, and the lobby window at the District offices in San Carlos. A news release was circulated to local media, a message was distributed through social media and notices placed on the BART ticket machines in the county. Public meetings were held in Daly City on September 19 with two attendees and in San Carlos on September 20 with three attendees. Ms. Martinez said 11 comments were received on the BART Plus Ticket Program, five in favor of the discontinuation and six wanting the program continued. Ms. Martinez said one comment was received on the proposal to eliminate unproductive fixed-route trips and that was in support of the proposal.

Discontinuing Participation in the BART Plus Ticket Program Effective January 1, 2013

Executive Officer, Customer Service and Marketing Rita Haskin said staff is recommending discontinuation of participation in the BART Plus Ticket Program. The District started participating in 1991 as a way for customers to easily connect between BART and SamTrans service. She said since that time the portion of the stored BART value on the ticket has not changed. Ms. Haskin said per an early BART memo the ticket wasn't designed for bus-to-bus commuting, which is how it appears to be used. BART officials have stated that if TransLink, now called Clipper, is implemented region-wide it may be necessary to discontinue the BART Plus Ticket Program in order to focus use on the TransLink ticket. Ms. Haskin said SamTrans has fully transitioned to Clipper since the end of 2011. She said AC Transit discontinued participating in the BART Plus Ticket Program about nine years ago due to fiscal losses. San Francisco Municipal Railway, Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority and the Dumbarton Express buses are all taking steps to withdraw from the program by the end of this

year. Ms. Haskin said recent analysis of the use and fiscal impact determined that SamTrans is losing much needed fare revenue, which has brought staff to the point of requesting discontinuing participation in the program.

Director Adrienne Tissier asked how much fare revenue is being lost. Ms. Haskin said approximately \$500,000 year.

Public Comment

Andy Chow, Redwood City, said there should be some sort of program maintained for BART riders taking SamTrans.

Adina Levin, Menlo Park, said she is concerned with cutting the BART Plus Ticket Program at the same time as the Service Plan (SSP) is being undertaken. The SSP will require more people to transfer especially in San Francisco and will cause people to pay 26 percent more. The Board should work for a better transfer program. The SSP outreach should include the price impact to riders since there is no longer a transfer program.

Peter Ratto, San Mateo, said he is in favor of discontinuing the BART Plus Ticket Program. The Program has not changed since 1991. If he had to buy an individual SamTrans pass and an individual Muni pass he would spend \$128, but the \$64 he gives to SamTrans for the pass goes to SamTrans and the \$64 he gives to Muni goes to Muni. Mr. Ratto said currently the bulk of the revenue from the BART Plus Ticket Program goes back to BART. He said the two local transit agencies, SamTrans and Muni, are subsidizing a ticket program where the bulk of the revenue goes back to the system that has the highest farebox recovery. Mr. Ratto said SamTrans should not be offering such a subsidy since the other 38,000 of the riders cannot take advantage of this program.

Jenny Gee, Daly City, said the program was introduced to promote the use of public transportation. The program offers her the flexibility to use regional transportation. Ms. Gee said the Clipper Card does not offer transfers and the BART Plus is more affordable than the Clipper Card. She asked the Board not to terminate participation in the program.

Jerry Grace, San Pablo, said he didn't realize this program was going to be eliminated.

Director Carole Groom said there are 1,900 customers that board SamTrans with a BART Plus Ticket and before the Board makes a decision she would like staff to provide some more financial analysis because not collecting over \$500,000 in fares is a lot of money. Ms. Haskin said staff calculated the loss by assuming an average of 2,000 rides, which equals 1,000 passengers who are riding round trip. She said if those 1,000 passengers purchased a SamTrans monthly pass for \$64 it would bring in \$640,000 a month and subtracting out the money we receive back from the BART Plus Ticket Program of \$15,000 brings to a total \$625,000.

Director Karyl Matsumoto asked if there is abuse with the ticket in the system. Ms. Haskin said yes, because there are no constraints on the ticket.

Director Zoe Kersteen-Tucker said with the SSP people are being asked to transfer more and a real cost analysis hasn't been done for the riders. Ms. Haskin said staff is exploring a similar

discount Muni offers and that is if a passenger transfers from BART to Muni with a Clipper Card only a 25-cent discount is given. She said staff is looking into this type of discount with Muni.

Director Tissier said the Clipper Card is trying to accommodate so much that it has become a nightmare.

Elimination of Select Unproductive Fixed-route Trips Effective January 13, 2013

Director, Bus Transportation Chester Patton said staff is recommending the elimination of two unproductive fixed-route trips. He said there are two trips that reach the threshold of a 25 percent reduction in revenue service miles per trip, which triggers a requirement for a public hearing. Mr. Patton said SamTrans regularly reviews its ridership throughout the system and has identified these two trips as candidates for elimination given they are not cost effective. He said combined, the trips carry, on average, fewer than six passengers per day. Mr. Patton said these trips are from community Routes 36 (South San Francisco) and 72 (Redwood City, North Fair Oaks, Atherton). He said Route 36 starts at 3:14 p.m., carries fewer than an average of five passengers per day and is preceded by a trip starting at 3:11 p.m. Mr. Patton said the five customers on this trip would have to adjust their schedule by three minutes to take the same route to the same destination. He said Route 72 trip starts at 3:30 p.m. and carries an average of less than one passenger per day and is preceded by a trip starting at 2:43 p.m., 47 minutes earlier. He said the one customer who sometimes rides this trip would have to adjust his or her schedule by 47 minutes to take the same route to the same destination. Mr. Patton said the proposed changes would go into effect on January 13, 2013 with Runbook 110.

Director Matsumoto asked if Route 36 serves school children. Mr. Patton said Route 36 serves El Camino High School. He said there are three buses in the afternoon separated by a very short amount of time and there is capacity on these buses.

Public Comment

Jerry Grace, said it is BART's 40th birthday.

Legal Counsel David Miller said the Board has heard presentations on the two items and these matters will come back to the Board in November for approval. He said staff will take into account questions raised by the Board concerning the BART Plus Ticket Program. Mr. Miller said the Board has satisfied all the requirements for the public hearing.

A motion (Tissier/Lloyd) to close the public meeting was approved.

Chair Deal said no action is required of the Board today and the recommended action will be presented to the Board at the November 14 meeting.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the consent calendar (Groom/Lloyd).

- a. Approval of Minutes of Board of Directors Meeting of September 12, 2012
- b. Acceptance of Statement of Revenues and Expenses for August 2012

PUBLIC COMMENT

Joshua Hugg, Housing Leadership Council of San Mateo County, said they promote quality of life within San Mateo County as housing opportunities become available. He said their Board voted in 2010 to support the San Carlos Transit Village because it is a great example of what the Grand Boulevard aspires to be. Mr. Hugg said they feel affordability is an important part of any housing project. He said this project now has no affordability component.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Resolution of Appreciation for Rich Napier, Executive Director, City/County Association of Governments (C/CAG)

Chair Deal said Mr. Napier served 17 years with C/CAG and will be retiring at the end of 2012. He said under Mr. Napier's leadership C/CAG pursued a thoughtful and creative agenda to expand transit and transportation opportunities resulting in several innovative programs that have eased congestion, encouraged residents to shift to alternative transportation modes and improve the mobility and quality of life for the people of San Mateo County.

Mr. Napier said it was a team approach with C/CAG, the District, the Peninsula Corridor Joint Powers Board and the San Mateo County Transportation Authority. He said this is a wonderful county and has wonderful leaders.

Director Tissier thanked Mr. Napier for all his work and said he was very successful for San Mateo County and well respected within the region.

Director Matsumoto said Mr. Napier was great at leveraging funds for San Mateo County.

Director Kersteen-Tucker said her first experience with Mr. Napier was when Measure T passed for the Devils Slide Initiative and he made it possible to get funding for the Devil's Slide Tunnel.

Director Groom said she served on C/CAG for a number of years and is amazed with Mr. Napier's ability to work with all the cities and the county.

Director Shirley Harris said when she first came on the Board Mr. Napier took the time to educate her on what C/CAG is and does.

A motion (Tissier/Harris) to approve the resolution was approved unanimously by roll call.

Chair Deal said he attended the American Public Transportation Association (APTA) Annual Conference along with Director Harris. He said he attended a panel discussion on High Speed Rail (HSR) with a focus on California. The panel spoke about HSR getting off to a bad start and HSR may not be the appropriate term for the Bay Area and suggested it be called High Performance Rail. Chair Deal said he took a tour on Seattle's new Bus Rapid Transit system and the system has the ability to change a traffic light and there are reader boards at all stops.

Chair Deal announced public member recruitment begins today for two seats expiring on December 31, 2012. Applications are available on the website and due November 9. The nominating committee is comprised of Director Groom, Director Jeff Gee and himself.

REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER/CEO

Deputy CEO Chuck Harvey reported:

- Presented 25-year Safe Worker Awards to Earl Newton and Robert Santiago and 20-Year Safe Worker to Ajit Mann, Genaro Rimando and Ashok Singh.
- Human capital investment continued with over 1,243 hours of training in September.
- The Marketing Department received two first place AdWheel awards at the APTA Annual meeting for the El Camino Real (ECR) weekend timetable and for materials marketing the transition to Clipper.
- The new ECR weekend service has been very successful and there is a significant increase in on-time performance (OTP). On Sunday, October 7 the service ran over 90 percent on-time. Total weekend ridership is down in September, but this route was up 1.2 percent.
- Fixed-route averaged more than 23,000 miles between road calls and Redi-Wheels averaged more than 35,000 miles between road calls, both exceeding the 20,000 miles District standard. Staff is in final negotiations to renew the Contracted Urban Bus (CUB) service.
- Staff has been working to ensure Redi-Wheels service quality is high and last month achieved 90 percent OTP.
- Staff is in the process of renewing the Fare Assistance Program for Redi-Wheels. Approximately 1,400 riders qualify for this program.
- Transportation specials:
 - A San Francisco International Airport emergency exercise.
 - Staff has been meeting with the Devil's Slide Tunnel Task Force to discuss providing special service for an event for the opening of the tunnel.
- There have been recent service challenges on Caltrain. The September OTP fell to 86.6 percent, which is unacceptable. There have been a series of incidents and events, some outside of our control and some influenced by really poor decisions by TransitAmerica Service Inc. (TASI) management on the ground. There were four incidents in September that accounted for the majority of the delays: a near miss on September 19 that delayed 11 trains; the loss of a the radio communication link was loss on San Bruno Mountain on September 21 that affected 25 trains; the first northbound train broke down and delayed 33 trains on September 24; and a vehicle was struck on September 26 that resulted in a 71-minute track closure and significant delays. Staff has debriefed with TASI senior management and they are aware of staff's concerns and the need to address mechanical issues as well as recovery and the decisions they make. TASI has replaced its general manager here and has flown in senior leadership, including the president, executive vice president and a mechanical expert. Staff is also speaking with them on improving customer communications.
- The reading file contains a flyer for the SSP outreach meetings in October, a flyer for the increase in parking fees at the Colma Park and Ride and the fall *Transit Fun Guide*.
- The Triennial Customer Survey is currently underway.
- The next Connecting with Customers Event is tomorrow at the Park and Ride lot in Pacifica.

COMMUNITY RELATIONS COMMITTEE – R. Guilbault

MOTION

- a. Proclamation Designating October as Disabilities Awareness Month

A motion (Groom/Kersteen-Tucker) to approve the proclamation was approved unanimously.

SUBJECTS DISCUSSED

- b. Key Communications and Outreach Messages
- c. Accessibility Update
- d. PCC Update
- e. Citizens Advisory Committee Liaison Report
- f. Mobility Management Report – End-of-Year Performance – postponed until next month
- g. Multimodal Ridership Report – August 2012

FINANCE COMMITTEE – Z. Kersteen-Tucker

RESOLUTION

- a. Authorize Extension of Safe Harbor Shelter Transit Ticket Program Through December 2015

A motion (Kersteen-Tucker/Tissier) to approve the resolution was approved unanimously by roll call.

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE – S. Harris

SUBJECT DISCUSSED

- a. State and Federal Legislative Update

PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT & SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE – A. Lloyd

SUBJECT DISCUSSED

- a. Senior Mobility Initiative – Mobility Ambassador Recognition

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

No discussion

BOARD MEMBER REQUESTS/COMMENTS

Director Matsumoto said as the representative to the San Mateo County Transportation Authority (TA) at the October meeting the Board authorized an amendment to the Fiscal Year 2013 budget by \$3 million for Caltrain's Communications Based Overlay Signal System/Positive Train Control Project.

Director Guilbault said she now has some additional responsibilities at her job. She is now president of the Community Safety Foundation for the American Automobile Association and their first grant was to the American Red Cross for \$2 million for disaster preparedness.

Director Kersteen-Tucker said Director Guilbault has just released a book titled The Latina's Guide to Success in the Workplace. She said in the last month she has had several people on the Coastside ask her about various ways to access bus schedules either through cell phone or smart phone. Director Kersteen-Tucker said one idea was being able to use the iCoastside application. She asked if the Board could get an update on the use and evaluation of these types of applications. Mr. Harvey said staff will bring a presentation to the Board at a future meeting.

Director Harris said she attended a presentation on social media at the APTA Annual and Manager, Programming and Monitoring Melanie Choy did her APTA Leadership presentation on this subject.

Director Tissier thanked Communications Manager Jayme Ackemann for her efforts in preparing a news conference on the money received from the California Transportation Commission.

GENERAL COUNSEL PROPOSAL

None

DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING – November 14, 2012 at 2 p.m., San Mateo County Transit District, Administrative Building, 1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos, CA 94070.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:30 p.m.